FROM BIBLICAL STORY TO BIBLICAL INTERPRETATION – A CRITICAL TRANSITION

By

Margaret Mary Therese Kelleher

BA (Melb.), MEd (Melb.), BTheol (MCD)

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

January 2011

Melbourne College of Divinity
ABSTRACT

The intention of this thesis is to address the transition from the primary school child’s understanding of bible stories to an understanding of scripture at a level commensurate with the adolescent’s developing capacity for critical thinking and formal operational thought. The impetus for the study comes from experience in teaching religious education in the Catholic secondary school where students’ questions indicate that a literalist interpretation presents difficulties well into adolescence.

Classroom religious education is seen as education for faith. The approach to the teaching of scripture is critical engagement with the biblical text which draws on contemporary biblical scholarship and takes cognisance of the nature of the text and the characteristics of religious language and biblical genres. An examination of official Catholic Church documents reveals that these approaches are consistent with the post-Vatican II pronouncements on education and on the interpretation of scripture.

The approach taken is informed by structural developmental theory which provides insights into the cognitive capacity of the student and the cognitive demands of the biblical text. The educative task is to provide a supportive learning environment and a pedagogy which develops students’ skills in recognising and comprehending religious metaphor and in applying these skills to an understanding of religious myth and parable. Although the particular context is the Catholic Christian secondary school, the study is relevant to other Christian educational settings, including adult education. Critical interpretation of scripture is seen as an essential foundation for a critically conscious and committed adult faith and Christian praxis.
STATEMENT OF ORIGINALITY

I hereby certify that this thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other institution and affirm that to the best of my knowledge, the thesis contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference is made in the text of the thesis.

Signed:  

Date:  

______________________________
This Thesis is dedicated to the memory of my parents,

Francis KELLEHER

and

Alice KELLEHER (nee McCarthy)
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I should like to acknowledge the on-going patience, encouragement and generosity of my Supervisor, Dr Maryanne Confoy, rsc, throughout the course of this thesis. Her erudition opened up exciting new areas of research to be explored, her wise counsel ensured that the exploration did not lose sight of the specific issues which are the subject of this thesis.

I should also like to acknowledge the assistance and courtesy of the staff of the MCD Libraries, especially those at the Dalton McCaughey Library, Parkville.
## CONTENTS

**LIST OF TABLES**

x

**LIST OF FIGURES**

xii

**PREFACE**

1

**INTRODUCTION**

3

**CHAPTER 1: THE LEARNING CONTEXT: ECCLESIAL AND SECULAR**

Introduction 15

1.1 Catholic Christian Education: Foundations 16

1.2 Catholic Christian Education: The Australian Catholic Secondary School 25

1.3 The Contemporary Cultural Context: Catholic School Students in the Twenty-first Century 40

Summary 57

**CHAPTER 2: THE RESEARCH ISSUE: STUDENTS’ UNDERSTANDING OF THE BIBLICAL TEXT**

Introduction 59

2.1 The Research Issue: Need and Justification 61

2.2 Science and Religion: Student Perceptions 69

2.3 Development of Religious Thinking: The Research of Ronald Goldman 75

2.4 On-going Discourse on Religious Thinking 89

2.5 An Alternative Conceptual Framework: Research by Loman and Francis 99
CHAPTER 3: THE TEACHING OF RELIGIOUS EDUCATION: THEORETICAL FOUNDATIONS

Introduction

3.1 Religious Education: Contemporary Theoretical Models
3.2 Catechesis Revisited: From Catechesis to New Evangelisation
3.3 Teaching Religious Education: Principles to Guide Classroom Practice
3.4 An Approach to Religious Education for the Twenty-first Century

Summary

CHAPTER 4: EXPLORING THE ISSUE: A STRUCTURAL DEVELOPMENTAL PERSPECTIVE

Introduction

4.1 Cognitive Development: Jean Piaget
4.2 Cognitive Development: Post-formal Operations—Perry and Belenky
4.3 Cognitive Development: Beyond Piaget—Kitchener and Kuhn
4.4 From Cognitive Development to Transformative Learning and Dialectical Thinking: Mezirow and Basseches
4.5 Extending the Perspective Beyond the Cognitive: Erikson, Newman and Newman, and Kegan
4.6 Faith development and the Secondary School Student

Summary
CHAPTER 5: THE BIBLICAL TEXT

Introduction 203

5.1 The Study of Scripture: A Historical Perspective 204

5.2 Teaching the Bible: A Historical Perspective 220

5.3 Approaches to Biblical Interpretation 232

5.4 Hermeneutics and Meaning 242

Summary 249

CHAPTER 6: THE LEARNER AND THE BIBLICAL TEXT

Introduction 252

6.1 The Characteristics of Religious Language 253

6.2 Figurative Language: Metaphor, Models, Paradigms and Symbols 260

6.3 Literary Genre 273

6.4 Metaphorical Thinking: Empirical Studies 282

6.5 Religious Thinking and Scientific Thinking 297

6.6 Perspectives on Religious Truth 303

Summary 309

CHAPTER 7: TEACHING FOR TRANSFORMATION

Introduction 312

7.1 The Process of Transformation 313

7.2 Factors which Facilitate and Factors which Impede Transformative Learning 315
7.3 Insights from Cognitive Development Theories: A Theoretical Framework 320

7.4 Applying the Insights of Developmental Theory to Teaching the Biblical Text 327

7.5 Relativism and a Demythologisation of the Sacred 335

7.6 An Approach to Teaching for Transformation 340

Summary 343

CHAPTER 8: CONCLUSION 345

AFTERWORD 358

BIBLIOGRAPHY 361

APPENDIX 1: The Australian Catholic Secondary School: An Overview of Historical Perspectives to Catechesis 423

APPENDIX 2: The Loman Index of Biblical Interpretation (LIBI) 434

APPENDIX 3: Faith Development Theory: Fowler and Slee 438
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1: Influences on dimensions of religious development 29
Table 1.2: Influences on students’ religious development, 1998 34
Table 1.3: Religious Practice: Year 12 – Flynn, 1972-1998 41
Table 1.4: Comparison of church attendance of Catholics for selected age groups: 1996, 2001 42
Table 1.5: Religious beliefs and commitment: Year 12, 1998 44
Table 1.6: Comparison of mean scores on Francis scale of attitude to Christianity: 1974 and 1994 48
Table 1.7: Generation Y study: Religious practice and beliefs (Catholics) 50
Table 1.8: Influence of the Catholic school on belief and unbelief 52
Table 2.1: Operational thinking about religious stories 78
Table 2.2: Concepts of the Bible: kind of book 79
Table 2.3: Concepts of the Bible: how it came to be written 80
Table 2.4: Concepts of the Bible: truth of the Bible 80
Table 2.5: Concepts of the Bible: relevance to life 81
Table 2.6: Truth of the Bible: Stages according to Yes/No answers 83
Table 2.7: Gender differences in modes of interpreting the Bible 102
Table 2.8: Age differences in modes of interpreting the Bible 102
Table 4.1: Outline of Positions in Perry’s Scheme 160
Table 4.2: Simplified version of Perry’s Scheme 161
Table 4.3: Outline of Perspectives in Belenky et al. (1986) and points of comparison with Perry’s (1970) scheme 163
Table 4.4: Two forms of procedural knowledge 164
Table 4.5: Stages in the Reflective Judgment Model 169
Table 4.6: Kuhn’s steps toward mature epistemological understanding 175
Table 4.7: Stages of Faith Development 196
Table 4.8: Stages of Faith x Ages 197
Table 6.1: Kinds of language usage (Binkley) 257
Table 6.2: Recognition and comprehension of the “by bread alone” metaphor in the story of Jesus’ temptation according to cognitive level 285
Table 6.3: Stages of complementarity in thinking and corresponding epistemological stage 300
Table 6.4: Sample responses representative of the different stages of complementarity in thinking 302
Table 6.5: Stages in the construction of logical necessity 307
Table 7.1: Epistemological Framework 322
Table 7.2: Epistemological Functioning 323
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 4.1: Diagrammatic summary of Mezirow’s transformative learning  179

Figure 4.2: Diagrammatic representation of Mezirow’s process of Critical Reflection  181

Figure 4.3: Diagrammatic summary of Basseches’ dialectical epistemology  185